Dante and Epicurus
A Dualistic Vision of Secular and Spiritual Fulfilment

LEGENDA

LEGENDA, founded in 1995 by the European Humanities Research Centre of the University of Oxford, is now a joint imprint of the Modern Humanities Research Association and Maney Publishing. Titles range from medieval texts to contemporary cinema and form a widely comparative view of the modern humanities, including works on Arabic, Catalan, English, French, German, Greek, Italian, Portuguese, Russian, Spanish, and Yiddish literature. An Editorial Board of distinguished academic specialists works in collaboration with leading scholarly bodies such as the Society for French Studies and the British Comparative Literature Association.

MHRA

The Modern Humanities Research Association (MHRA) encourages and promotes advanced study and research in the field of the modern humanities, especially modern European languages and literature, including English, and also cinema. It also aims to break down the barriers between scholars working in different disciplines and to maintain the unity of humanistic scholarship in the face of increasing specialization. The Association fulfils this purpose primarily through the publication of journals, bibliographies, monographs and other aids to research.

Maney Publishing

Maney Publishing is one of the few remaining independent British academic publishers. Founded in 1900 the company has offices both in the UK, in Leeds and London, and in North America, in Philadelphia. Since 1945 Maney Publishing has worked closely with learned societies, their editors, authors, and members, in publishing academic books and journals to the highest traditional standards of materials and production.

ITALIAN PERSPECTIVES

Editorial Committee
Professor Simon Gilson, University of Warwick (General Editor)
Dr Francesca Billiani, University of Manchester
Dr Manuele Gragnolati, Somerville College, Oxford
Dr Catherine Keen, University College London
Professor Martin McLaughlin, Magdalen College, Oxford

Founding Editors
Professor Zygmunt Barański and Professor Anna Laura Lepschy

In the light of growing academic interest in Italy and the reorganization of many university courses in Italian along interdisciplinary lines, this book series, founded by Maney Publishing under the imprint of the Northern Universities Press and now continuing under the Legenda imprint, aims to bring together different scholarly perspectives on Italy and its culture. *Italian Perspectives* publishes books and collections of essays on any period of Italian literature, language, history, culture, politics, art, and media, as well as studies which take an interdisciplinary approach and are methodologically innovative.

APPEARING IN THIS SERIES

1. *The Letters of Giacomo Leopardi 1817-1837*, ed. by Prue Shaw
2. *Nelle Carceri di G. B. Piranesi*, by Silvia Gavuzzo-Stewart
3. *Speculative Identities: Contemporary Italian Women's Narrative*, by Rita Wilson
4. *Elio Vittorini: The Writer and the Written*, by Guido Bonsaver
5. *Origin and Identity: Essays on Svevo and Trieste*, by Elizabeth Schächter
6. *Italo Calvino and the Landscape of Childhood*, by Claudia Nocentini
7. *Playing with Gender: The Comedies of Goldoni*, by Maggie Günsberg
8. *Comedy and Culture: Cecco Angiolieri's Poetry and Late Medieval Society*, by Fabian Alfie
9. *Fragments of Impegno*, by Jennifer Burns
10. *Contesting the Monument: The Anti-Illusionist Italian Historical Novel*, by Ruth Glynn
11. *Camorristi, Politicians and Businessmen*, by Felia Allum
12. *Speaking Out and Silencing*, ed. by Anna Cento Bull and Adalgisa Giorgio
13. *From Florence to the Heavenly City: The Poetry of Citizenship in Dante*, by Claire E. Honess
14. *Orality and Literacy in Modern Italian Culture*, ed. by Michael Caesar and Marina Spunta
15. *Pastoral Drama in Early Modern Italy: The Making of a New Genre*, by Lisa Sampson
16. *Sweet Thunder: Music and Libretti in 1960s Italy*, by Vivienne Suvini-Hand
17. *Il teatro di Eduardo De Filippo*, by Donatella Fischer
18. *Imagining Terrorism*, ed. by Pierpaolo Antonello and Alan O'Leary
19. *Boccaccio and the Book: Production and Reading in Italy 1340-1520*, by Rhiannon Daniels
20. *Ugo Foscolo and English Culture*, by Sandra Parmegiani
21. *The Printed Media in Fin-de-siècle Italy: Publishers, Writers, and Readers*, ed. by Ann Hallamore Caesar, Gabriella Romani, and Jennifer Burns
22. *Giraffes in the Garden of Italian Literature*, by Deborah Amberson
23. *Remembering Aldo Moro*, edited by Ruth Glynn and Giancarlo Lombardi
24. *Disrupted Narratives: Illness, Silence and Identity*, by Emma Bond
25. *Dante and Epicurus: A Dualistic Vision of Secular and Spiritual Fulfilment*, by George Corbett

Managing Editor: Dr Graham Nelson, 41 Wellington Square, Oxford OX1 2JF, UK
www.legendabooks.com

Dante and Epicurus

A Dualistic Vision of Secular and Spiritual Fulfilment

❖

George Corbett

LEGENDA

Italian Perspectives 25
Modern Humanities Research Association and Maney Publishing
2013

Published by the
Modern Humanities Research Association and Maney Publishing
1 Carlton House Terrace
London SW1Y 5AF
United Kingdom

LEGENDA is an imprint of the
Modern Humanities Research Association and Maney Publishing

Maney Publishing is the trading name of W. S. Maney & Son Ltd,
whose registered office is at Suite 1C, Joseph's Well, Hanover Walk, Leeds LS3 1AB

ISBN 9-781-907975-79-0 (HB)

First published 2013

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or disseminated or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, or stored in any retrieval system, or otherwise used in any manner whatsoever without the express permission of the copyright owner

© Modern Humanities Research Association and W. S. Maney & Son Ltd 2013

The Open Access version of this book, available at www.taylorfrancis.com and at www.mhra.org.uk, has been made available under a Creative Commons Attribution-NoDerivatives (CC BY-ND) 4.0 International License.
Funded by the University of St Andrews.

Cover: 875 Design

Copy-Editor: Richard Correll

CONTENTS

❖

Acknowledgements ix

Editions and Abbreviations x

Introduction 1

PART I: DANTE AND EPICURUS

1 Dante's Reception of Epicureanism 8

2 Dante's Epicureanism and the Emergence of Secular Man 42

PART II: THE EPICUREAN AXIS OF *INFERNO* X

3 The Secular and Spiritual Hemispheres of *Inferno* X 66

4 Epicurean Mortalism and Christian Faith 89

PART III: ANTE-PURGATORY AND DANTE'S DUALISM

5 The Virtuous Pagans 122

6 The Horizon between Pagan Reason and Christian Faith 147

Conclusion 175

Bibliography 179

Index 186

TO MY PARENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book grew out of my research at Trinity College and the Italian department, the University of Cambridge. First and foremost, therefore, I would like to thank my doctoral supervisors Zygmunt G. Barański and Robin Kirkpatrick for their inspiration, intellectual generosity, and continued friendship. I am also deeply indebted to Simon Gilson, Claire Honess and the anonymous reader of the manuscript. Their expert advice and astute comments were invaluable for the final shaping of the book.

There are many other people who have helped me personally or academically during the research and writing of this book. I am deeply grateful to you all and I regret that, in these brief acknowledgments, I can only thank some of you by name: Catherine Buckwell, Andrew Corbett, Clare Corbett, Patricia Corbett, Henry Dawe, David Hall, Anne Leone, Hamish Low, Gabrielle Maas, John Marenbon, Vittorio Montemaggi, Mike Murphy, Giuseppe Pezzini, Matthew Phipps, Ambrogio Camozzi Pistoja, Beatrice Priest, Stefano Rebeggiani, Valery Walker and Dan Watson. More specifically, I would like to thank Richard Correll for copy-editing the manuscript and Graham Nelson for guiding the book to completion. I would also like to thank Patrick Corbett for many discussions during the gestation of this research, Mary Corbett for her support and computer visualisation of the diagrams and, finally, my wife Elizabeth *sine qua non*.

I am sincerely grateful to the institutions which have supported me and my research: Trinity College, Cambridge; the Italian Department and the Faculty of Modern and Medieval Languages, the University of Cambridge; the Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa; Institutum Pontificium Altioris Latinitatis, Rome; Vivarium Novum, Montella; and the Arts and Humanities Research Council.

G.C., Cambridge, March 2013

EDITIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

❖

A. Dante

(1). The *Commedia*

Inf. Inferno, in *La Commedia secondo l'antica vulgata*, ed. by Giorgio Petrocchi, 4 vols (Milan: A. Mondadori, 1966–67), II
Purg. Purgatorio, in *La Commedia secondo l'antica vulgata*, ed. by Giorgio Petrocchi, 4 vols (Milan: A. Mondadori, 1966–67), III
Par. Paradiso, in *La Commedia secondo l'antica vulgata*, ed. by Giorgio Petrocchi, 4 vols (Milan: A. Mondadori, 1966–67), IV

(2). Vernacular works

Conv. Convivio, ed. by Franca Brambilla Ageno, 3 vols (Florence: Le Lettere, 1995)
VN. Vita nuova, ed. by Domenico De Robertis, in Dante Alighieri, *Opere minori*, 3 vols (Milan and Naples: Ricciardi, 1995), I, 3–247
VN. (Gor.) *Vita nova*, ed. by Guglielmo Gorni (Turin: Einaudi, 1996)
Rime. Rime, ed. by Domenico De Robertis, 3 vols (Florence: Le Lettere, 2002)

(3). Latin works

DVE. De vulgari eloquentia, ed. by Pier Vincenzo Mengaldo, in Dante Alighieri, *Opere minori*, 3 vols (Milan and Naples: Ricciardi, 1979), III, 1–237
Mon. Monarchia, ed. by Bruno Nardi, in Dante Alighieri, *Opere minori*, 3 vols
(Milan and Naples: Ricciardi, 1979), III, 239–503
Mon. (Sh.) *Monarchia*, ed. by Prue Shaw (Florence: Le Lettere, 2009)
Questio. Questio de aqua et terra, ed. by Francesco Mazzoni, in Dante Alighieri, *Opere minori*, 3 vols (Milan and Naples: Ricciardi, 1979), III, 691–880
Epist. Epistole, ed. by Arsenio Frugoni and Giorgio Brugnoli, in Dante Alighieri, *Opere minori*, 3 vols (Milan and Naples: Ricciardi, 1979), III, 505–643
Can. Epistola a Cangrande, ed. by Enzo Cecchini (Florence: Giunti, 1995)

B. Commentaries

(1). Commentaries cited according to the *Dartmouth Dante Project*

The following commentaries on the *Commedia* are cited according to the *Dartmouth Dante Project* <http://dante.dartmouth.edu/> [accessed 1 October 2012]. The citation style used is: 'name', gloss to *cantica*, 'canto'. 'line' (e.g. 'Benvenuto da Imola, gloss to *Inf.*, VI. 34–36').

Jacobo Alighieri (1322)
Graziolo Bambaglioli (1324)
Jacopo della Lana (1324–28)
Guido da Pisa (1327–28)
L'Ottimo Commento (1333)

Pietro Alighieri [1] (1340–42)
Pietro Alighieri [3] (1359–64)
Giovanni Boccaccio (1373–75)
Benvenuto da Imola (1375–80)
Francesco da Buti (1385–95)
Cristoforo Landino (1481)
Alessandro Vellutello (1544)
Lodovico Castelvetro (1570)
Niccolò Tommaseo (1873)
G. A. Scartazzini and G. Vandelli (1929)
Natalino Sapegno (1955–57)
Charles S. Singleton (1970–75)
Anna Maria Chiavacci Leonardi (1991–97)
Robert Hollander (2000–07)

(2). Commentaries cited from printed editions below

Barbi, Michele, ed. (updated by Giuseppe Vandelli), *La Divina Commedia* (Milan: Ulrico Hoepli, 1946)
Kay, Richard, trans. and commentary, *Monarchia* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1998)
Kirkpatrick, Robin, ed. and trans., *The Divine Comedy*, 3 vols (London: Penguin, 2006–07)
Romani, Matteo, ed., *Il Convito di Dante* (Reggio Emilia: G. Davolio and Figlio, 1862)
Shaw, Prue, ed. and trans., *Monarchy*, Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)
——ed. and trans., *Monarchia*, Cambridge Medieval Classics (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995)
Sinclair, John D., ed. and trans., *The Divine Comedy of Dante Alighieri*, 3 vols (New York: Oxford University Press, 1961)

C. Online references [accessed 1 October 2012]

Biblical references are to the Vulgate bible, in the *Nova Vulgata* edition available online via the Vatican website: <http://www.vatican.va/latin/latin_bible.html>
References to Thomas Aquinas are to the Leonine edition available online via the *Corpus Thomisticum* <http://www.corpusthomisticum.org/>
References to Augustine of Hippo are to the Latin editions available online via <http://www.augustinus.it/>

D. List of further abbreviations used

Barbi. *La Divina Commedia*, ed. by Michele Barbi, updated by Giuseppe Vandelli (Milan: Ulrico Hoepli, 1946)
ED. Enciclopedia dantesca, ed. by Umberto Bosco, 6 vols (Rome: Istituto della Enciclopedia Italiana, 1970–78)
DE. The Dante Encyclopedia, ed. by Richard Lansing (New York: Garland, 2000)
SD. Studi danteschi
DS. Dante Studies
ST. Summa Theologiae
CG. Summa Contra Gentiles

E. English Translations

The translations of the following works by Dante are adapted from these readily available and literally translated English editions:

Commedia, *The Divine Comedy of Dante Alighieri*, ed. and trans. by Robert M. Durling; introduction and notes by Ronald L. Martinez and Robert M. Durling, 3 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996–2011)

Convivio, *The Banquet*, trans. with intro. and notes by Christopher Ryan (Saratoga, CA: Amma Libri, 1989)

De vulgari eloquentia, *De vulgari eloquentia*, ed. and trans. by Steven Botterill (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)

Monarchia, Monarchy, ed. and trans. by Prue Shaw, Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)

For Classical Roman sources, the translations are adapted from the side-by-side English translations found in the Loeb series published by Harvard University Press.

All other translations, except as specifically indicated in the text, are my own. In most instances, a literal translation [in square brackets] follows the original passage. Where the sense of the original passage is clear from the main text, the original passage (in parentheses) follows the paraphrase. Discussion is always with regard to the passage in the original. The translations should only be regarded, therefore, as a potentially useful prop or crib.